



RICK SNYDER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY
LANSING

R. KEVIN CLINTON
STATE TREASURER

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE STATE TAX COMMISSION

***Lansing Center, Governor's Room
333 East Michigan Avenue
Lansing, Michigan***

***Monday, December 16, 2013
9:00 a.m.***

***PRESENT: Douglas B. Roberts, Chair STC
Robert H. Naftaly, Member STC
Barry S. Simon, Member STC

Kelli Sobel, Executive Director
LaNiece Densteadt, Recording Secretary***

The item numbers referred to in the minutes correspond to the agenda items as numbered.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the minutes of November 4, 2013. (Item 1 on agenda)

Tracy Case, Nathan Franckowiak, Nicole Busey, and Honor Sheard appeared to appeal the denial of the Air and Water Pollution Control Exemptions for Marathon Petroleum Company LP (File No's 2-5961, 2-5963, 2-5964, 2-5965, 1-3720, 1-3721, 1-3722, 1-3723, 1-3724, 1-3726, 1-3727, 1-3729, 1-3730, 1-3731, 1-3732, 1-3733, 1-3734, 1-3735, 1-3736). The Commission heard from the parties involved. It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, and approved to adopt staff recommendations regarding the Air and Water Pollution Control Exemption Certificates 2-5961, 2-5963, 2-5964, 2-5965, 1-3721, 1-3722, 1-3723, 1-3724, 1-3726, 1-3727, 1-3729, 1-3730, 1-3731, 1-3734, 1-3735, 1-3736, 1-3720, 1-3732, and 1-3733 (Marathon Petroleum Company LP). (Item 2 on agenda)

Camille Silda and Brian Moore appeared regarding the Industrial Facilities Exemption for Basic Metals, Inc. (File No 2013-092) It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Roberts, and approved to adopt staff recommendation to approve the Industrial Facilities Exemption Certificate 2013-092 (Basic Metals, Inc.). (Item 2 on agenda)

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation to allow a special one-year waiver through December 31, 2014 for those local units and counties whose certification level requirements have increased as a direct result of

wind turbine values. The Commission asked the Certification Advisory Committee to study the issue and report back to the Commission. The Commission also approved a one year waiver for Huron and Tuscola Counties to share an Equalization Director at the MAAO level. The Commission also indicated that this will be the last waiver approved for Huron and Tuscola Counties and that they must employ a properly certified Equalization Director for 2014 or their current Director must enter the 2015 MMAO program. (Item 3 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 18 of 2013 Random Week for Qualified Businesses. (Item 4 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 19 of 2013 The 2014 Property Tax Appeal Procedures. (Item 5 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 20 of 2013 2014 Boards of Review. (Item 6 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 21 of 2013 the Michigan Tax Tribunal Interest Rates. (Item 7 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 22 of 2013 P.A. 161 of 2013 Disabled Veterans Exemption and Affidavit Form 5107. The Commission also approved that the 2014 July Board of Review only can review and approve an exemption for the 2013 year for those individuals who missed the filing for the 2013 exemption with the December Board of Review. The Commission also approved to issue guidance to assessors to treat this exemption similar to the poverty exemption when entering the exemption into assessing software so that the property does not uncap when individuals are no longer eligible for the exemption. (Item 8 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 23 of 2013 P.A. 497 of 2012 Transfers of Ownership Supplement. (Item 9 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved the updated Q and A Regarding Boards of Review, Q and A Regarding Qualified Agricultural Guidelines, Transfer of Ownership Guidelines, and Q and A Regarding Property Classification. (Items 10, 11, 12, and 13 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Executive Director Sobel's recommendation to adopt a 40% economic factor for 2014 for Great Lakes Gas Transmission and to amend the prior factor adopted for 2014 for ANR Pipeline and Mid-Michigan Gas Storage to 40%. (Item 14 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt staff recommendation for the 2014 System Economic Factor for the Electric Distribution Cooperatives. (Item 15 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt Executive Director Sobel's recommendation to discontinue the Advisory Committee for Bulletins and seek review and advice from affected parties, interest groups and our partner organizations. The

Commission also approved to rotate membership every two years for the Advisory Committees for Education, Discipline and Certification. (Item 16 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to allow BS&A to use an electronic version of the 2014 Personal Property Statement Form 632. (Item 17 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved the Personal Property Forms 3991 – 2014 Gas Turbine and Diesel Electric Generator Report, Form 4094 – 2014 Steam Electric Report, Form 4070 – 2014 Hydroelectric Report and Nuclear Plant Composite Factors. (Item 18 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Re-certifications and New Certifications of Computerized Tax Rolls for the following: (Item 19 on agenda)

These certifications will expire on **May 1, 2016**.

New Certifications:

Menominee County

Harris Township

Spalding Township

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Special Exemptions Agenda. The Commission also approved an additional Commercial Rehabilitation Certificate C2013-010 for MKOS Real Estate in the City of Livonia contingent on the City forwarding the amended resolution. (Item 20 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Exemptions Agenda. (Item 21 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Concurrences**. (Item 22 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification](#))

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt staff recommendations on the MCL 211.154 **Special Items Agenda**. (Item 23 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification](#))

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **amend** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 24 on agenda)

City of Trenton, Wayne County

154-12-1502 THE DETROIT EDISON COMPANY; 54-999-99-0324-000; PERSONAL-UTILITY PROPERTY

2010 AV from \$ 5,866,400 to \$ 6,163,100 TV from \$ 5,866,400 to \$ 6,163,100

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **deny** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 24 on agenda)

Pennfield Township, Calhoun County

154-13-0879 JUDY LAWTON; 13-18-000-034-00; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 50,000 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 50,000

Frenchtown Township, Monroe County

154-13-0346 HOLIDAY DEVELOPMENT; 5807-000-986-10; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 43,100 to \$ 20,671 TV from \$ 43,100 to \$ 20,671

Gerrish Township, Roscommon County

154-12-1501 FRANK J. BARRETT; 72004-762-024-0000; REAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 4,000 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 2,000

2012 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 4,000 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 2,054

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to allow the **withdrawal** of the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 24 on agenda)

City of Highland Park, Wayne County

154-13-0746 DTE ENERGY COMPANY; 82-43-999-00-0616; Personal-Utility Property

2011 AV from \$ 7,150,700 to \$ 7,205,854 TV from \$ 7,150,700 to \$ 7,205,854

2012 AV from \$ 8,880,700 to \$ 10,477,600 TV from \$ 8,880,700 to \$ 10,477,600

City of Trenton, Wayne County

154-12-1503 THE DETROIT EDISON COMPANY; 54-999-99-1711-031; PERSONAL-UTILITY PROPERTY

2010 AV from \$ 623,300 to \$ 709,200 TV from \$ 623,300 to \$ 709,200

154-12-1504 MICHIGAN CONSOLIDATED GAS CO.; 54-999-99-0924-008; PERSONAL - UTILITY PROPERTY

2010 AV from \$ 306,600 to \$ 320,400 TV from \$ 306,600 to \$ 320,400

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved the following MCL 211.154 petitions as **concurrences**, initially noticed as non-concurrences. (Item 24 on agenda)

Billings Township, Gladwin County

154-13-0834 BRIAN D. PARSONS; 26-030-027-100-011-00; REAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 77,600 to \$ 71,100 TV from \$ 79,466 to \$ 72,800

City of East Lansing, Ingham County

154-13-0775 CATAMARAN PBM OF MARYLAND, INC.; 33-20-90-51-175-000; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 5,000 to \$ 69,700 TV from \$ 5,000 to \$ 69,700

2012 AV from \$ 5,500 to \$ 67,100 TV from \$ 5,500 to \$ 67,100

2013 AV from \$ 5,800 to \$ 53,000 TV from \$ 5,800 to \$ 53,000

154-13-0776 SCHNABEL FOUNDATION COMPANY; 33-20-90-44-460-900; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 25,000 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 25,000

154-13-0779 CV EAST LANSING MI LLC; 33-20-90-49-229-400; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 84,700 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 84,700

Richland Township, Kalamazoo County

154-13-0764 DOUGLAS AND SUSAN TANKERSLEY; 3903-07-351-009; Real Property

2011 AV from \$ 85,600 to \$ 101,200 TV from \$ 85,600 to \$ 101,200

2012 AV from \$ 81,900 to \$ 97,200 TV from \$ 81,900 to \$ 97,200

2013 AV from \$ 77,900 to \$ 93,700 TV from \$ 77,900 to \$ 93,700

City of Ferndale, Oakland County

154-13-0375 FUJIFILM NA CORP; 24-99-00-009-041; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 6,930 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 6,930

City of Novi, Oakland County

154-13-0823 LIS ART CONSERVATION & RESTORATION; 50-99-00-013-225; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 1,290 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 1,290

City of Southfield, Oakland County

154-13-0825 RESOURCE GLOBAL PROFESSIONALS; 76-99-75-618-300; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 50,830 to \$ 73,960 TV from \$ 50,830 to \$ 73,960

City of Wixom, Oakland County

154-13-0374 OCE FINANCIAL SERVICES INC.; 96-99-00-007-123; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 494,450 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 494,450

154-13-0408 JAVA MASTER; 96-99-00-011-043; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 54,250 to \$ 91,350 TV from \$ 54,250 to \$ 91,350

Oxford Township, Oakland County

154-13-0371 LEAF FINANCIAL CORP; P-99-00-006-040; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 2,040 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 2,040

Royal Oak Township, Oakland County

154-13-0372 OCE FINANCIAL SERVICES INC.; S-99-00-002-026; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 118,830 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 118,830

City of Ann Arbor, Washtenaw County

154-13-0828 INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL MGMT.; 09-90-00-080-337; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 17,400 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 17,400

2013 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 14,800 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 14,800

City of Detroit, Wayne County

154-13-0361 LITTLE CAESAR ENTERPRISES #158; 13990795.04; Personal Property

2013 AV from \$ 26,050 to \$ 0 TV from \$ 26,050 to \$ 0

154-13-0758 WATHA SEVEN MILE INVESTMENTS; 17005066-71; REAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 177,540 to \$ 6,240 TV from \$ 177,540 to \$ 6,240

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt all other MCL 211.154 petitions. ([See attached link for file identification.](#)) (Item 24 on agenda)

Public Comment (Item 25 on agenda): No member of the public wished to comment.

Executive Director Sobel stated: The 2014 State Tax Commission Meetings will no longer be held at the Lansing Center. The Commission will be meeting at the Okemos Conference Center located at Exit 110 off of 96. There will be directions on the website that will be linked to every agenda.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to approve release of Bulletin 24 of 2013 regarding Development Property once the Governor has signed the bill. (Add on to agenda)

The next Commission meeting will be held February 10, 2014 at the Okemos Conference Center in Okemos A & B Conference Rooms, 2187 University Park Drive, Okemos.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting of the State Tax Commission at 11:00 a.m.

DATE TYPED: December 17, 2013

DATE APPROVED: February 10, 2014

**Douglas B. Roberts, Chair
State Tax Commission**

**Robert H. Naftaly, Member
State Tax Commission**

**Barry N. Simon, Member
State Tax Commission**